

Zeroes of the Neutrino Mass Matrix

Paul H. Frampton,^(a) Sheldon L. Glashow^(b) and Danny Marfatia^(b)

^(a) *Department of Physics and Astronomy*
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, NC 27599-3255

^(b) *Department of Physics*
Boston University, Boston, MA 02215

We assume there to be precisely three left-handed neutrino states whose Majorana masses are generated by an unspecified mechanism. Were CP conserved, the symmetric neutrino mass matrix $\mathcal{M}$ would be real and all six of its distinct entries could be experimentally determined. But CP is not conserved so that $\mathcal{M}$ is likely to be complex. As a result, not all nine of its convention-independent real parameters can be determined without an appeal to theory. Thus we examine the possibility that a restricted class of neutrino mass matrices may suffice to describe current data, namely those complex symmetric matrices several of whose entries vanish. We find that there are seven acceptable textures with two independent zeroes, and we explore their contrasting phenomenological implications. Textures with more than two independent zeroes appear to be excluded by experiment.

1. Introduction

Quark masses and mixings are described by two 3×3 matrices which involve a total of ten convention-independent real quantities: four Kobayashi-Maskawa parameters and six positive quark masses. The lepton sector requires only three additional parameters (the charged lepton masses) in the minimal—and manifestly incomplete—standard model wherein neutrinos are massless.

In this paper we assume that neutrino phenomenology can be formulated in terms of three left-handed neutrino states with a complex symmetric Majorana mass matrix $\mathcal{M}$. We do not commit ourselves to any particular mechanism by which neutrino masses are generated. Of the twelve real parameters characterizing $\mathcal{M}$, three are arbitrary phases of the three flavor eigenstates. Thus the neutrino sector involves nine convention-independent parameters. The two squared-mass differences and the four Kobayashi-Maskawa analogs are likely to be measureable in practice. So also is the quantity $|\mathcal{M}_{ee}|$ through the search for neutrinoless double beta decay. There remain two parameters that are measureable in principle but apparently not in practice. We arrive at the dreadful conclusion that *no presently conceivable set of feasible experiments can fully determine the neutrino mass matrix.*

This is the context and the justification for our discussion of a conjectured simplicity in the structure of the neutrino mass matrix. In particular we propose that $\mathcal{M}$, expressed in the (e, μ, τ) flavor basis, may have several vanishing entries. The number n of independent zeroes takes into account the symmetry of the mass matrix: it counts instances that $\mathcal{M}_{ij} = 0$ where $i \geq j$. We find that currently available data disfavor all cases with $n \geq 3$, but that there are seven empirically tolerable textures with $n = 2$.

We begin by recalling the standard notation [1] for three-flavor neutrino oscillations. With an appropriate choice of the phases of the three flavor eigenstates, we may express $\mathcal{M}$ as follows:

$$\mathcal{M} = U^* D U^\dagger \quad (1.1)$$

where U is the neutrino analog to the Kobayashi-Maskawa matrix expressing flavor eigenstates in terms of mass eigenstates:

$$\begin{pmatrix} \nu_e \\ \nu_\mu \\ \nu_\tau \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} c_2 c_3 & c_2 s_3 & s_2 e^{-i\delta} \\ -c_1 s_3 - s_1 s_2 c_3 e^{i\delta} & +c_1 c_3 - s_1 s_2 s_3 e^{i\delta} & s_1 c_2 \\ +s_1 s_3 - c_1 s_2 c_3 e^{i\delta} & -s_1 c_3 - c_1 s_2 s_3 e^{i\delta} & c_1 c_2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \nu_1 \\ \nu_2 \\ \nu_3 \end{pmatrix} \quad (1.2)$$

with s_i and c_i standing for sines and cosines of θ_i . The remaining five parameters appear in the diagonal matrix

$$D = \begin{pmatrix} m_1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & m_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & m_3 \end{pmatrix} \quad (1.3)$$

where m_1 and m_2 , in general, are complex numbers while m_3 can be taken to be real and non-negative with no loss of generality. In the analysis to follow we make the following hypotheses, all of which are favored (if not yet established) by current experimental data:

(1) For solar neutrinos, we assume oscillations to be large, but we also assume that they are measurably non-maximal [2]. In particular, we take $0.6 \leq \sin^2 2\theta_3 \leq 0.96$, with 0.8 as a best-fit value. The relevant squared-mass difference $||m_1|^2 - |m_2|^2|$ is taken to be $\Delta_s \approx 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ eV}^2$.

(2) For atmospheric neutrinos, we assume oscillations to be large (possibly maximal) and dominantly of the form $\nu_\mu \rightarrow \nu_\tau$. In particular, we take $\tan^2 \theta_1 \simeq 1$ [3]. The relevant squared-mass difference $||m_{1,2}|^2 - |m_3|^2|$ is taken to be $\Delta_a \approx 3 \times 10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2$.

(3) For the subdominant angle θ_2 which controls atmospheric $\nu_\mu \leftrightarrow \nu_e$ oscillations we assume $\sin^2 2\theta_2 \leq 0.1$ in accordance with CHOOZ data [4].

It will be useful to define the ratio of squared-mass differences, whose estimated value is:

$$R_\nu \equiv \frac{\Delta_s}{\Delta_a} \approx 2 \times 10^{-2}. \quad (1.4)$$

2. Seven Two-Zero Textures

With the above hypotheses and notation, we turn to the question of which two independent entries of $\mathcal{M}$ can vanish in the basis wherein the charged lepton mass matrix is diagonal. Of the fifteen logical possibilities, we find just seven to be in accord with our empirical hypotheses. We discuss them individually, with the non-vanishing entries in each case denoted by X 's. Our results are presented to leading order in the small parameter s_2 . We begin with a texture in which $\mathcal{M}_{ee} = \mathcal{M}_{e\mu} = 0$:

$$\text{Case } A_1: \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & X \\ 0 & X & X \\ X & X & X \end{pmatrix}$$

For this texture, $\mathcal{M}_{ee} = 0$ so that the amplitude for no-neutrino double beta decay vanishes to lowest order in neutrino masses. If Case A_1 is realized in nature, the neutrinoless process simply cannot be detected. There is even more to say. Using Eqs. (1.1)–(1.4) we find:

$$m_1 \simeq +(s_2 t_1 t_3) m_3 e^{i\delta}, \quad m_2 \simeq -(s_2 t_1/t_3) m_3 e^{i\delta}, \quad (2.1a)$$

$$R_\nu \simeq s_2^2 t_1^2 |t_3^2 - 1/t_3^2|, \quad (2.1b)$$

where t_i stands for $\tan \theta_i$. Two of the squared neutrino masses are suppressed relative to the third by a factor of s_2^2 . As a result we find that s_2 can lie close to its present experimental upper limit. This prediction will become more precise when θ_3 is better measured. However, the CP-violating parameter δ is entirely unconstrained. For case A_1 the subdominant angle θ_2 is likely to be measureable and neutrinos may display observable CP violation.

$$\text{Case } A_2: \begin{pmatrix} 0 & X & 0 \\ X & X & X \\ 0 & X & X \end{pmatrix}$$

This texture, with $\mathcal{M}_{ee} = \mathcal{M}_{e\tau} = 0$, is described by Eqs. (2.1a,b) with t_1 replaced by $-1/t_1$. Its phenomenological consequences are nearly the same as those of Case A_1 .

$$\text{Case } B_1: \begin{pmatrix} X & X & 0 \\ X & 0 & X \\ 0 & X & X \end{pmatrix}$$

With $\mathcal{M}_{\mu\mu} = \mathcal{M}_{e\tau} = 0$, we find an acceptable solution if and only if $|s_2 \cos \delta \tan 2\theta_1| \ll 1$, in which case we obtain:

$$m_1 \simeq -(t_1^2 + s_2 (e^{-i\delta} t_1 + e^{i\delta}/t_1)/t_3) m_3, \quad (2.2a)$$

$$m_2 \simeq -(t_1^2 - s_2 (e^{-i\delta} t_1 + e^{i\delta}/t_1) t_3) m_3, \quad (2.2b)$$

$$R_\nu \simeq |s_2 \cos \delta \tan 2\theta_1 (t_3 + 1/t_3)|. \quad (2.2c)$$

The three neutrinos are nearly degenerate in magnitude because $t_1^2 \simeq 1$. Conversely, although atmospheric neutrino oscillations can be nearly maximal, the possibility that t_1 is exactly one is excluded. The appearance of the large factor $\tan 2\theta_1$ in Eq. (2.2c)

requires $s_2 \cos \delta$ to be tiny if R_ν is to be small. Thus s_2 is unlikely to be measureable *unless* $0 < |\cos \delta| \ll 1$. If this texture is correct, and if s_2 is found to depart significantly from zero, CP violation in the neutrino sector must be nearly maximal.

This texture is also promising in regard to the search for neutrinoless double beta decay. We obtain

$$\mathcal{M}_{ee} \simeq -t_1^2 \sqrt{\Delta_a/|1 - t_1^4|}. \quad (2.3)$$

Because atmospheric neutrino oscillations are observed to be nearly maximal, Eq. (2.3) tells us that $\mathcal{M}_{ee}$ is likely to exceed 100 meV. The rate of neutrinoless double beta decay may approach its current experimental upper limit.

$$\text{Case } B_2: \quad \begin{pmatrix} X & 0 & X \\ 0 & X & X \\ X & X & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

This texture, with $\mathcal{M}_{\tau\tau} = \mathcal{M}_{e\mu} = 0$, is described by Eqs. (2.2a, b, c) with t_1 replaced by $-1/t_1$. Its phenomenological consequences are nearly the same as those of Case B_1 .

$$\text{Case } B_3: \quad \begin{pmatrix} X & 0 & X \\ 0 & 0 & X \\ X & X & X \end{pmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \text{Case } B_4: \quad \begin{pmatrix} X & X & 0 \\ X & X & X \\ 0 & X & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

For Case B_3 , with $\mathcal{M}_{\mu\mu} = \mathcal{M}_{e\mu} = 0$, we obtain the relations

$$m_1 \simeq -t_1^2 (1 - s_2(e^{-i\delta} t_1 + e^{i\delta}/t_1)/t_3) m_3, \quad (2.4a)$$

$$m_2 \simeq -t_1^2 (1 + s_2(e^{-i\delta} t_1 + e^{i\delta}/t_1) t_3) m_3. \quad (2.4b)$$

The phenomenological implications of Eqs. (2.4a, b) are substantially the same as those of Case B_1 . The same is true for Case B_4 with $\mathcal{M}_{\tau\tau} = \mathcal{M}_{e\tau} = 0$. It results in Eqs. (2.4a, b) with t_1 replaced by $-1/t_1$. Thus the four B_i cases are experimentally almost indistinguishable.

Case C :
$$\begin{pmatrix} X & X & X \\ X & 0 & X \\ X & X & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

Our seventh and last allowed texture has $\mathcal{M}_{\mu\mu} = \mathcal{M}_{\tau\tau} = 0$. We obtain the relations

$$m_1 \simeq -\left(1 - e^{i\delta} \cot 2\theta_1 / (t_3 s_2)\right) m_3, \quad (2.5a)$$

$$m_2 \simeq -\left(1 + e^{i\delta} \cot 2\theta_1 t_3 / s_2\right) m_3. \quad (2.5b)$$

We can obtain a small value of R_ν if and only if $||m_1| - |m_2|| \ll m_3$, in which event we find

$$s_2 \cos \delta \approx \cot 2\theta_1 \cot 2\theta_3. \quad (2.6)$$

This approximate equality shows that s_2 can be large enough to be measured if atmospheric neutrino oscillations are not too nearly maximal. The observed value of R_ν results from a small departure from the equality of Eq. (2.6) by an amount of order s_2^2 .

Furthermore, for Case C we obtain

$$|m_{1,2}|^2 \simeq (1 + \cos^2 \delta \tan^2 2\theta_3) m_3^2 \quad \text{and} \quad |\mathcal{M}_{ee}| \simeq m_3.$$

From these results, we find

$$|\mathcal{M}_{ee}| \simeq |\sqrt{\Delta_a} \cot 2\theta_3 / \cos \delta|. \quad (2.7)$$

Thus the effective parameter governing neutrinoless double beta decay must be at least of order 30 meV and could be considerably larger.

An interesting version of Case C arises if $\theta_1 \equiv \pi/4$ and $\theta_2 \equiv 0$. In place of Eqs. (2.5a, b) we get the single constraint

$$s_3^2 m_1 + c_3^2 m_2 + m_3 = 0. \quad (2.8)$$

With $|m_1| \simeq |m_2|$ to ensure that R_ν is small, Eq. (2.8) yields the relation

$$\frac{|\mathcal{M}_{ee}|^2}{\Delta_a} \simeq \frac{1 - \sin^2 2\theta_3 \sin^2 \frac{\chi}{2}}{\sin^2 2\theta_3 \sin^2 \frac{\chi}{2}},$$

where χ is the relative phase between m_1 and m_2 and $0 < \chi \leq \pi$. Thus $|\mathcal{M}_{ee}|$ is bounded below by $\sqrt{\Delta_a} \cot 2\theta_3$, as it is in Eq. (2.7).

No other two-zero texture of the neutrino mass matrix is compatible with our empirical hypotheses. It is easily verified that no two of our allowed two-zero textures can be simultaneously satisfied while remaining consistent with our empirical hypotheses. It follows that there is no tolerable three-zero texture. For example, a neutrino mass matrix with vanishing diagonal entries (the Zee Ansatz) cannot yield a large enough value of R_ν unless solar neutrino oscillations are very nearly maximal [5], a situation that appears to be strongly disfavored by experiment.

3. Concluding Comment

The seven allowed two-zero neutrino textures fall into three classes: A (with two members), B (with four members), and C . The textures within each class are difficult or impossible to distinguish experimentally, but each of the three classes has radically different implications. For class A , the subdominant angle θ_2 is expected to be relatively large, but no-neutrino $\beta\beta$ decay is forbidden. For class B , the latter process should be measureable by the next generation of double beta decay experiments, whilst s_2 may or may not be large enough to be detected. However, if s_2 is comparable to its experimental upper limit, CP violation must be nearly maximal and should be readily detectable by proposed experiments. For class C , no-neutrino $\beta\beta$ decay is likely to be observable and θ_2 ought to be large enough to measure (unless $\theta_1 \equiv \pi/4$) and to permit a search for CP violation. It is surprising that such a great variety of textures of the neutrino mass matrix can fit what is presently known about neutrino masses and oscillations. Future data should reveal which, if any, of these textures should serve as a guide to the model builder.

We are aware that specific textures of the neutrino mass such as we discuss cannot be preserved to all orders in the unspecified interactions which generate neutrino masses. However, straightforward elaborations of the standard model can generate zeroes of $\mathcal{M}$ in tree approximation in such a manner that these entries remain tiny when radiatively corrected. To illustrate this fact we close with just one example. We sketch a model in which softly-broken lepton number violation yields $\mathcal{M}$ with the texture of Case C . Similar constructions, perhaps more contrived, can generate mass matrices with any of the other textures we have discussed:

In the basis of charged lepton mass eigenstates, we introduce two singly-charged SU(2) singlet spinless mesons coupled antisymmetrically to pairs of left-handed leptons: $\phi_{e\mu}^-$ to the e and μ doublets, and $\phi_{\tau\mu}^-$ to the τ and μ doublets. An additional doubly-charged spinless singlet, $\chi_{\mu\tau}^{--}$, couples to the right-handed $\mu^- \tau^-$ pair. These Yukawa couplings conserve lepton number and flavor symmetry. Soft breaking of both of these symmetries results from dim-3 couplings among the various ϕ , ϕ , χ combinations. Neutrino masses arise from finite 2-loop diagrams involving this trilinear coupling and two mass insertions. The resulting mass matrix has $\mathcal{M}_{\mu\mu} = \mathcal{M}_{\tau\tau} = 0$, as desired.

Acknowledgements

The work of PHF was supported in part by the Department of Energy under grant number DE-FG02-97ER-41036; that of SLG by the National Science Foundation under grant number NSF-PHY-0099529; and that of DM by the Department of Energy under grant number DE-FG02-91ER-40676.

References

- [1] *E.g.*, H. Georgi and S.L. Glashow, Phys. Rev. **D61**, 097301 (2000).
- [2] *E.g.*, J.N. Bahcall, M.C. Gonzalez-Garcia and C. Pena-Garay, hep-ph/0111150; and experimental references cited therein.
- [3] Y. Fukuda *et al.* [Super-Kamiokande Collaboration], Phys. Rev. Lett. **81**, 1562 (1998).
- [4] M Apollonio *et al.*, Phys. Lett. **B466**, 415 (1999).
- [5] P.H. Frampton, M.C. Oh and T. Yoshikawa, hep-ph/0110300.